

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

BEFORE THE
ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION

IN THE MATTER OF:)
SHARON REYNOLDS)
v) No. 14-0714
COMMONWEALTH EDISON COMPANY)
Complaint as to billing/)
charges in Chicago, Illinois.)

Chicago, Illinois
June 25, 2015

Met pursuant to notice at 11:00 a.m.

BEFORE:
MR. JOHN RILEY, Administrative Law Judge.

APPEARANCES:
MS. SHARON REYNOLDS
PO Box 9311
Chicago, Illinois 60609
appeared pro se;
MS. REBECCA A. GRAHAM
115 South LaSalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, Illinois 60603
appeared for Respondent.

SULLIVAN REPORTING COMPANY, by
Teresann B. Giorgi, CSR
084-000977

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22

I N D E X

<u>Witnesses:</u>	<u>Dir.</u>	<u>Crx.</u>	<u>Re-</u> <u>dir.</u>	<u>Re-</u> <u>crx.</u>	<u>By</u> <u>Examiner</u>
-------------------	-------------	-------------	---------------------------	---------------------------	------------------------------

NONE

E X H I B I T S

<u>APPLICANT'S</u>	<u>FOR IDENTIFICATION</u>	<u>IN EVIDENCE</u>
--------------------	---------------------------	--------------------

NONE

1 JUDGE RILEY: Pursuant to the direction of
2 the Illinois Commerce Commission, I now call
3 Docket 14-0714.

4 This is a complaint by Sharon Reynolds
5 versus Commonwealth Edison, as to billing and
6 charges in Chicago, Illinois.

7 And, Ms. Reynolds, you are still
8 appearing without counsel, is that correct?

9 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes.

10 JUDGE RILEY: I'd advice you, you can have a
11 counsel appear on your behalf any time during the
12 proceeding but they would have to take the record as
13 they found it. We wouldn't be able to go back and
14 start over.

15 And, counsel for ComEd, would you
16 enter an appearance, please.

17 MS. GRAHAM: On behalf of Commonwealth Company,
18 Rebecca A. Graham, 115 South LaSalle Street,
19 Suite 2600, Chicago, Illinois 60603. My telephone
20 number is 312-505-8154.

21 JUDGE RILEY: And I read a couple of transcripts
22 of prior sessions and it seemed to me that there was

1 going to be some investigations done by ComEd, some
2 meter reading or testing of some type.

3 MS. GRAHAM: Yes, that's correct.

4 A meter reader was going to go out and
5 confirm that the meter serving the property was
6 being used for Ms. Reynolds' billing is correct.
7 And that occurred on January 20th. And my notes
8 says that the customer was present. So, they did
9 confirm that the proper meter is the one being used
10 for Ms. Reynolds' billing.

11 JUDGE RILEY: Ms. Reynolds, I want to go back to
12 your complaint and get a little better understanding
13 of it.

14 The address you're talking about, is
15 it 6531 South Lowell, is that your home or is that
16 an apartment building?

17 MS. REYNOLDS: That was a townhouse that was
18 being rented for me, tenant.

19 JUDGE RILEY: You were leasing it.

20 MS. REYNOLDS: Yeah.

21 JUDGE RILEY: And what is Apartment 6527 and a
22 half?

1 MS. REYNOLDS: That's the townhouse apartment I
2 was living in.

3 JUDGE RILEY: I don't understand. What is
4 6531?

5 MS. REYNOLDS: That's the whole complex
6 building.

7 JUDGE RILEY: Oh, I see. Okay. So, this is a
8 whole series of townhouses?

9 MS. REYNOLDS: No. Inside there's apartment
10 buildings and in the back part there's townhouses.
11 And I was in the back part. But the whole complex
12 is 6531.

13 JUDGE RILEY: All right. But you occupy
14 6527 and a half.

15 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes.

16 And the whole thing started because
17 ComEd had me as an apartment number for an address.
18 And when I spoke to one of the reps over the phone,
19 she asked me in turn to go into the property manager
20 and ask her if she would tell her what my meter
21 number was. When I went in she told me that they
22 couldn't tell me my meter number, that ComEd would

1 have to come out.

2 So, in terms, I went back home and I
3 called ComEd back and relaid what was told to me.
4 In turn, the supervisor told me that they would have
5 someone come out, I believe it was October 31st of
6 last year. No one got back in contact with me and
7 let me know if they got the meter reading or not. I
8 contact them and that's how the whole thing started.

9 JUDGE RILEY: Is your apartment, the 6527 and a
10 half, is that separately metered?

11 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes, it is. Those apartments --
12 where they took me in, the meters are inside the
13 building. There's a basement next to -- two doors
14 down from me where I think my meter is in. And
15 after January, I think it was in April, I don't have
16 the paperwork right in front of me, but in April --
17 after the last meeting here, if she remember
18 correctly, she didn't quote it, they said that they
19 were having to come out for another meter reading to
20 get the right reading and the right meter that I was
21 on, because that was on the third floor. I don't
22 live inside the building and I wasn't on the third

1 floor.

2 JUDGE RILEY: You were on the -- I'm just --

3 MS. REYNOLDS: I explained to you, the whole
4 complex is a building, but in the back there's
5 townhouses. Inside the building there's apartments,
6 I don't know how many are on each floor. But they
7 didn't take me to the meter outside in the back
8 where I live at, they took me inside the building o
9 the third floor, for a meter reading on the floor
10 inside the building, but people live on that floor.
11 I don't live on that floor.

12 Since that time I did have to call the
13 police because they were supposed to come out for a
14 second reading and find out where the meter was
15 actually at, if it was in the back or not. I wasn't
16 home. The janitor went inside my apartment. I
17 called the police and he told me I should have went
18 back inside the building and told the manager what
19 had happened. But he tried to say that ComEd and
20 him had came out that day. They had -- in the
21 basement the leaves were piled up. There's no way
22 they could have walked down unless they cleaned that

1 out and it wasn't cleaned out.

2 JUDGE RILEY: All right. Wait.

3 Going back to my original question,
4 your apartment is separately metered.

5 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes.

6 JUDGE RILEY: And you have seen that meter?

7 MS. REYNOLDS: Not really. That's why they were
8 supposed to go back out. I've moved since then
9 because it was just too much and I had to call the
10 police on the janitor and they told me to go -- when
11 I went in, I know he had been all through the
12 apartment and he left a little tag saying him and
13 ComEd, which he didn't state, had been back out to
14 read the meter down in the basement that's in the
15 back where it should have been in the first place.

16 JUDGE RILEY: Are you alleging that you've been
17 overbilled?

18 MS. REYNOLDS: I don't know if I was overbilled,
19 but I know that they couldn't have done the right
20 meter reading. And they had apartment number
21 coincidentally -- after they did that, when I talked
22 to them on the phone, she said that when they went

1 there some lady told them thanks. So, she's under
2 the supply that I'm under now because they went to
3 6527 and a half, that's an address also and I didn't
4 know that. So, they went to an actual address.

5 So, after they did that, then they
6 went -- came on the complex and went inside the
7 building on the third floor and said that my meter
8 was inside the building. It wasn't in the back
9 where it should have been.

10 JUDGE RILEY: Is this just a one-room apartment
11 or is there several rooms or --

12 MS. REYNOLDS: No, it's an upstairs, downstairs.
13 I had the bedrooms upstairs and my living room and
14 kitchen downstairs and a bathroom upstairs.

15 JUDGE RILEY: All right.

16 Can ComEd --

17 MS. REYNOLDS: I had explained -- I'm sorry.

18 JUDGE RILEY: Go ahead.

19 MS. REYNOLDS: I already explained to her that
20 since I wasn't pleased of what was happening and all
21 these appointments that we were having, I feel like
22 I wasn't getting anywhere. I explained to them that

1 I was just going to move and that would be that.
2 And in turn I was told that even if I closed the
3 meter number that they gave me and got a new meter
4 number, they would still have to charge me for the
5 transfer of my lights over to the new address.

6 JUDGE RILEY: What is ComEd's -- can you shed
7 any light on this?

8 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, ComEd's position is that
9 there's no complaint here. We've gone out. We've
10 investigated the meter. We've showed Ms. Reynolds
11 which meter services her property. It's been
12 confirmed that it's correct. And frankly her bills
13 are extremely, extremely low, anywhere between \$12
14 and --

15 MS. REYNOLDS: But that's for your charge.
16 That's not from my supplier though.

17 MS. GRAHAM: \$12 to \$30 a month. And there's no
18 outstanding balance on this account. She had a
19 LIHEAP payment applied March 16th of this year and
20 she doesn't owe any money. I'm not sure what more
21 Ms. Reynolds wants us to do.

22 MS. REYNOLDS: Can I explain it also, another

1 problem was, if I cut the lights out in there, when
2 I come back downstairs the lights were on. So, when
3 the guy came out, when they did an inspection, he
4 told her that the plugs were messed up in there, but
5 it wasn't, but I wasn't going to fight it just to
6 correct it. If the lights were coming on without me
7 turning them on, that's definitely a problem.

8 JUDGE RILEY: Is your complaint essentially that
9 you were billed from the wrong meter still?

10 MS. REYNOLDS: That too. Yeah. So, I just
11 moved because they didn't seem to be able to clear
12 anything up for me. And I would have to take a
13 minute to find the paper, but she said in January,
14 they came back out after January and that is what
15 this meeting here was for, to find out if they could
16 get in the back -- in the basement and see if my
17 meter was down in there. They didn't do that.
18 That's what the continue was supposed to been on,
19 your Honor.

20 JUDGE RILEY: Where is your meter -- where is
21 the meter?

22 MS. REYNOLDS: I never found out, but I think it

1 was down in the basement right up by the meter two
2 doors down.

3 JUDGE RILEY: But ComEd knows which meter was
4 registering to the apartment.

5 MS. GRAHAM: The bottom line, the meter that is
6 servicing her property ends in 0659, they confirmed
7 that that's the right meter servicing her property.
8 She's been billed for the correct meter. They
9 confirmed that twice. The bills are low. I'm not
10 sure what more --

11 MS. REYNOLDS: The bills are low because it
12 seems like after I came here my supplier is not
13 charging me that much, but ComEd is.

14 JUDGE RILEY: Those are ComEd's records that
15 she's reading.

16 MS. REYNOLDS: Right. And she should have also
17 told you that prior to the last meeting, they were
18 supposed to come back out and find out where my
19 meter actually was because that wasn't the meter.
20 That meter wasn't even moving, what she had showed.

21 So, I had already -- I thought that
22 they would just clear it up and if it had to go

1 further, if it keeps going on -- it seems like it's
2 gotten worst since I moved with the light company.

3 JUDGE RILEY: But you're not getting
4 overcharged.

5 MS. REYNOLDS: But the thing of it is, your
6 Honor, I don't want to pay for someone else's meter.
7 I want to pay for what my meter is. And when they
8 did that, the person that lived at that address,
9 that's what they're being charged now also. That's
10 what started the whole thing. And they still -- at
11 the end, I don't think they know if they corrected
12 it or not because I had it forwarded to a P.O. Box.

13 JUDGE RILEY: I'm not --

14 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, our records show that
15 everything is correct.

16 MS. REYNOLDS: Did you come back out after
17 January?

18 MS. GRAHAM: My records show that we were out on
19 October 31st of 2014 and January 20th of 2015.

20 MS. REYNOLDS: When they came out in October,
21 they never contacted me back to tell me what my
22 meter was. And it was ComEd who told me that I

1 needed to take it further because they couldn't do
2 anything about it, to correct anything --

3 MS. GRAHAM: Were you --

4 MS. REYNOLDS: -- in October. That's why we
5 ended up here.

6 MS. GRAHAM: Were you present on January 20th
7 when they came out?

8 MS. REYNOLDS: What do you mean, was I present?

9 MS. GRAHAM: Were you present when --

10 MS. REYNOLDS: Yes, I was. That's the only way
11 that I could have told them that they took me inside
12 the building and what floor we went on. And then
13 they sent me a letter they're supposed to put new
14 meters in. That never happened.

15 JUDGE RILEY: What relief are you seeking? What
16 is it that you want the Commission to do?

17 MS. REYNOLDS: If I were -- if that wasn't my
18 meter and if I was charged for someone else's meter,
19 I don't want to be paying for it, regardless of how
20 much it was.

21 JUDGE RILEY: But ComEd's records say that you
22 were billed from the proper meter.

1 MS. REYNOLDS: If ComEd felt that way then why
2 did ComEd have a meter (sic) go inside the building
3 and ask the management office what was my meter
4 number? They needed to know.

5 JUDGE RILEY: But they know which meter is
6 hooked up to which apartment.

7 MS. GRAHAM: Yes. Judge, all I can say is our
8 records show everything was correct. The bills are
9 extremely low. And now, frankly, as Ms. Reynolds
10 has moved from that property and there's no
11 outstanding balance at this address, isn't this
12 completely moot?

13 JUDGE RILEY: I understand that.

14 MS. REYNOLDS: That's why I moved from that
15 address because they weren't clearing up anything.
16 And as she just stated, she's going back to January,
17 she has not -- since the last visit, no one from
18 ComEd went out to see if the meter was in the
19 basement, which I was told from the last session.

20 JUDGE RILEY: Ms. Reynolds, if we were to go to
21 hearing, what evidence would you produce to prove
22 what point? That's what I'm wondering.

1 MS. REYNOLDS: The same thing I proved when I
2 came here at this point, was that I used my bills
3 from ComEd showing that they didn't have me at an
4 address for that meter, they had me for apartment
5 number for my meter, that wasn't an address. And
6 also I would have been able to use -- also I spoke
7 to a supervisor who, in turn, told me -- well, after
8 they wouldn't give them the meter number to me over
9 the phone, that they would come out and investigate.
10 That wasn't on my part, that was ComEd.

11 So, I feel like it was the management
12 and ComEd in the first place, it wasn't my problem.
13 Because if they couldn't tell me my meter number,
14 they said that ComEd had to come out, then there was
15 nothing else that I could do anyway. So, that's how
16 we ended up here. So, it should have been the
17 management office and ComEd instead of me, in the
18 first place. Because they still didn't do anything.
19 They did not go back out and check the basement to
20 see if my meter was in there.

21 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, I'm going to make an oral
22 motion to dismiss. At the very least, this

1 complaint is moot.

2 MS. REYNOLDS: First of all, you didn't file --

3 MS. GRAHAM: In any event, we did go out. We
4 did a meter investigation. Our records show that
5 the meter was correct, that the billing is correct.
6 There's nothing to go to hearing on. There is no
7 material issue to try.

8 MS. REYNOLDS: I would argue that -- because you
9 still have not answered to the Judge why didn't you
10 come back out and check the basement, which is in
11 the back where the townhouses are?

12 MS. GRAHAM: Judge --

13 MS. REYNOLDS: I couldn't be inside the building
14 on the third floor and the meter because there's
15 apartments in there. I don't live in one of those
16 apartments.

17 MS. GRAHAM: Judge, I can't speak to how the
18 metering is done in this building, but it's not that
19 uncommon for your meter to be located in a different
20 place than you might expect in a building situation
21 like this one.

22 The meter is correct. The billing is

1 correct. There's nothing else to do here.

2 JUDGE RILEY: Well, I have a motion to dismiss
3 on the table.

4 Ms. Reynolds, you're opposed to that
5 motion, I take it.

6 MS. REYNOLDS: No, because if I continue having
7 problems with her or with the situation after this
8 is over with, then I'll go find a lawyer or
9 something and go to court because this is
10 ridiculous. If that's the case then they shouldn't
11 have lingered on this long. That's what I told them
12 from the last visit, I would just move.

13 JUDGE RILEY: Do you object to the motion to
14 dismiss -- she's moving to dismiss your case.

15 MS. REYNOLDS: But she's not my lawyer, she's
16 not for me, she's for ComEd.

17 JUDGE RILEY: Well, I understand that. She's
18 making the motion.

19 MS. REYNOLDS: Your Honor, that's fine. That's
20 okay.

21 JUDGE RILEY: So, you don't object to the motion
22 to dismiss?

1 MS. REYNOLDS: It's not going to help me to keep
2 going on. Because as I stated, if I was in the
3 wrong, they would have come back out and checked the
4 meter in the back in the basement, they did not do
5 that, which they told at the last meeting they would
6 do it to clear it up.

7 So I thought -- when I saw it wasn't
8 going anywhere at the last meeting, I say, Well, I'm
9 moving. Could that be the end of it? And I was
10 told no, they wanted to go back and see if they
11 checked the basement and see if there was a meter
12 for me. They didn't do that anyway, so I just
13 moved.

14 MS. GRAHAM: I stand on the motion to dismiss
15 and I would ask that it be with prejudice.

16 JUDGE RILEY: That's where we are right now,
17 Ms. Reynolds. What I'm going to be required to do
18 now is to write up what they call a proposed order
19 and I'll issue it to the parties, both you and
20 Ms. Graham. And it will state that I either
21 recommend granting or not granting the motion to
22 dismiss. And I will give you an opportunity to file

