

**STATE OF ILLINOIS
ILLINOIS COMMERCE COMMISSION**

AMEREN TRANSMISSION COMPANY OF ILLINOIS)
)
Petition for a Certificate of Public Convenience and)
Necessity, pursuant to Section 8-406.1 of the Illinois)
Public Utilities Act, and an Order pursuant to Section 8-) Docket No. 12-0598
503 of the Public Utilities Act, to Construct, Operate and)
Maintain a New High Voltage Electric Service Line and)
Related Facilities in the Counties of Adams, Brown,)
Cass, Champaign, Christian, Clark, Coles, Edgar, Fulton,)
Macon, Montgomery, Morgan, Moultrie, Pike,)
Sangamon, Schuyler, Scott and Shelby, Illinois.)

**TESTIMONY OF JERALD M. TARBLE ON BEHALF OF TARBLE LIMESTONE
ENTERPRISES**

Direct Testimony of Jerald M. Tarble

On Behalf Of

Tarble Limestone Enterprises

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

I. INTRODUCTION AND WITNESS QUALIFICATIONS

Q. Please state your name.

A. Jerald M. Tarble

Q. In what capacity are you employed?

A. I am President of Charleston Stone Company, President of Quality Lime Company, and Manager of Van Tarble & Sons, LLC, all of which are members of Tarble Limestone Enterprises.

Q. For whom are you testifying in this proceeding?

A. Tarble Limestone Enterprises and its members Charleston Stone Company, Quality Lime Company and Van Tarble & Sons, LLC.

Q. Please summarize your professional experience.

A. I have a degree in mechanical engineering. I began working for Charleston Stone Company in 1972 as plant manager. In 1984, I became President of Charleston Stone Company and Quality Lime Company, positions which I currently retain.

Q. What are your duties and responsibilities in your present position?

A. In my present position with Tarble Limestone Enterprises, and its members, I oversee strategic planning as well as the financials of the entities.

Q. Have you ever testified before this or any other utility commissions?

28 A. No.

29

30 **II. BACKGROUND OF TARBLE LIMESTONE ENTERPRISES**

31

32 **Q. Please describe Tarble Limestone Enterprises.**

33

34 A. Tarble Limestone Enterprises is composed of three separate members: Charleston Stone
35 Company, Quality Lime Company, and Van Tarble & Sons, LLC. Founded in the mid 1930's
36 the entities that comprise Tarble Limestone Enterprises have grown to include The Charleston
37 Stone Company quarry located in Charleston, Illinois, as well as the Quality Lime Company
38 quarry located in Marshall, Illinois. Tarble Limestone Enterprises provides central Illinois with a
39 variety of limestone aggregate products, including, but not limited to, agricultural lime,
40 construction aggregates, as well as landscaping boulders.

41 **III. PURPOSE OF TESTIMONY**

42

43 **Q. What is the purpose of your testimony?**

44

45 A. ATXI is seeking an Order from the Illinois Commerce Commission authorizing it to
46 construct, operate, and maintain a 345 kilovolt (“kV”) electric transmission line. The operation
47 of this line will require the construction and expansion of nine substations. The line is estimated
48 to run for approximately 375 miles, the construction and related maintenance will hereinafter be
49 referred to as the “Project.” The entire Project will run from the Mississippi River eastward
50 across Illinois towards the Indiana State Line. Given the breadth of the Project and the
51 destructive nature of the work required to complete the Project, the property interests of various
52 individuals and/or entities are impacted. Tarble Limestone Enterprises, and its members, either
53 own or have a quantifiable interest in certain properties that are slated to be affected by the
54 construction and maintenance of the primary route of the Project. The purpose of my testimony

55 is to provide an overview of the Tarble Limestone Enterprises' property interests affected by the
56 Project and the financial consequences such impact will have on Tarble Limestone Enterprises.

57 **IV. IMPACT OF PROJECT PROPOSED BY ATXI ON THE INTERESTS OF**
58 **TARBLE LIMESTONE ENTERPRISES**

59
60 **Q. Does Tarble Limestone Enterprises or its members have any interest in property**
61 **that is impacted by the Primary Route of the Project?**

62
63 A. Yes. The primary route of the Project will run through both Coles and Clark County,
64 Illinois, in which Tarble Limestone Enterprises or its related members maintain multiple interests
65 in property. In support of the position that Tarble Limestone Enterprises' property interests will
66 be impacted by the construction and future maintenance of the primary route of the Project I
67 have attached Plat Maps identifying the property in which Tarble Limestone Enterprises either
68 have a current or future interest. In Coles County, Illinois, Charleston Stone Company, a
69 member of Tarble Limestone Enterprises, owns the property identified on the attached Plat Map
70 (1) as W. Cox (26.6 acres) and R.D. Shoot (20 acres). Plat Map (1) is attached to Jerald Tarble's
71 testimony as Tarble Exhibit 1.1. Adjacent to the land currently owned by Charleston Stone
72 Company is additional property (identified as Plat Map (1)/Coles County as William F. Weber
73 (210 acres), Charles O. Lanman (60 acres), and H.M. Coartney (150 acres)) (Tarble Exhibit 1.1)
74 from which Tarble Limestone Enterprises intended to lease mineral rights. The leases for the
75 mineral rights for these properties have not yet been fully executed due to the location of the
76 proposed primary route of the Project. Tarble Limestone Enterprises have already core drilled
77 and mined significant sections of these properties. The 75 foot easement sought by ATXI that
78 would impact these aforementioned properties contains 1,210,000 tons of limestone. The
79 easement sought on the property owned outright by Charleston Stone Company contains 242,000
80 tons of limestone. The easements sought on the properties that were intended to be leased, but

81 for the location of the primary route of the Project, contain 968,000 tons of limestone. The
82 limestone ledge averages 22 feet thick in these areas within Coles County and the density of the
83 limestone involved is 4,000 pounds per cubic yard. In Clark County, Illinois, Van Tarble and
84 Sons LLC, also a member of Tarble Limestone Enterprises, owns the property identified on the
85 attached Plat Map (2) as Nina Lichtenberger (222 Acres). Plat Map (2) is attached to Jerald
86 Tarble's Testimony as Exhibit 1.2. Van Tarble and Sons LLC leases the property to Quality
87 Lime Company, another member of Tarble Limestone Enterprises. The ground of this property
88 has already been core drilled. The easement sought on this property by ATXI contains 264,000
89 tons of limestone. The average thickness of the limestone ledge in this area is 24 feet and the
90 density of the limestone involved is 4,000 pounds per cubic yard.

91 **Q. What is the economic impact of the Proposed Primary Route of the Project on**
92 **Tarble Limestone Enterprises?**

93
94 A. Tarble Limestone Enterprises, and its members, had intentions to mine or are currently
95 mining certain properties located within Coles County and Clark County, Illinois. In Coles
96 County, Illinois, the easement sought by ATXI for the proposed primary route of the Project
97 impacts land owned outright by Tarble Limestone Enterprises' member Charleston Stone
98 Company and land which it intended to acquire by lease. The 75 foot easement which impacts
99 these properties contains 1,210,000 tons of limestone. A significant portion of these properties
100 had already been core drilled by Charleston Stone Company. The Charleston Stone Company's
101 average selling price for limestone of the nature and kind found within its properties in Coles
102 County, is \$11.81 per ton. Gross sales from the limestone contained within the easement sought
103 by ATXI on the Coles County property owned outright by Charleston Stone Company would
104 amount to \$2,858,020. Gross sales from the limestone contained within the easement sought by
105 ATXI on the Coles County properties intended to be leased would amount to \$11,432,080. The

106 proposed primary route of the Project would preclude Charleston Stone Company from
107 continuing its mining operations within the areas of the sought after easements at these properties
108 and would result in a net revenue loss to Charleston Stone Company of \$871,200 from the
109 property owned outright and \$3,484,800 from the property Charleston Stone Company intended
110 to lease. In Clark County, Illinois, Van Tarble and Sons LLC, also a member of Tarble
111 Limestone Enterprises, owns property which it currently leases to Quality Lime Company,
112 another member of Tarble Limestone Enterprises. The easement sought by ATXI which impacts
113 this property contains 264,000 tons of limestone. Quality Lime Company's average selling price
114 for limestone of the nature and kind found within this property is \$10.14 per ton. Gross sales
115 from the limestone contained within the easement sought by ATXI on this Clark County property
116 would amount to \$2,676,960. The proposed primary route of the Project would preclude Quality
117 Lime Company as lessor from continuing its mining operations within the area of the sought
118 after easement at this property and would result in a net revenue loss to Quality Lime Company
119 of \$1,267,200. Van Tarble and Sons LLC would also lose \$79,200 in lost royalties.

120 **Q: In addition to Tarble Limestone Enterprises' inability to continue its mining**
121 **operations at certain properties affected by the Primary Route of the Project Will it suffer**
122 **other economic impact?**

123
124 A. Yes. In addition to the limestone contained within the easements sought at the Coles and
125 Clark County properties which Tarble Limestone Enterprises intended to mine or were currently
126 mining, Tarble Limestone Enterprises also had plans to develop the sites of previous mining
127 operations, since exhausted, as residential subdivisions. These properties lie within the proposed
128 primary route for the Project. Tarble Limestone Enterprises has, in the past, developed as
129 residential subdivisions sites on which it had previously conducted mining operations. One such
130 example is the Golf-Lakes Subdivision in Marshall, IL (Clark County). Quality Lime Company,

131 a member of Tarble Limestone Enterprises, developed the Marshall, IL property following the
132 completion of its mining operations and then sold all lots located on the property which now
133 make-up the Golf-Lakes Subdivision. The proposed primary route of the Project would prevent
134 Tarble Limestone Enterprises from later developing the properties it, or its members, own and
135 which lie within the primary route of the Project. The last property developed for residential use
136 by Tarble Limestone Enterprises was in the early 1980's. At that time, Quality Lime Company
137 sold 59 plus parcels of property with an average price of \$20,000 per parcel. Given inflation, it
138 is expected that any property developed for residential use in the future would exceed the
139 \$20,000 per parcel price that Quality Lime Company received in the early 1980's. Along with
140 the inability to, in the future, develop as residential subdivisions certain properties in which it
141 had exhausted its mining operations, Tarble Limestone Enterprises will also endure increased
142 business costs due to the placement of the primary route of the Project. Assuming for purposes
143 of this testimony that ATXI obtains the easements it needs from Tarble Limestone Enterprises to
144 complete the primary route of the Project, Tarble Limestone Enterprises will have to undertake
145 additional cost provoking measures to ensure that the mining operations it conducts adjacent to
146 any easement obtained will not generate flyrock that can potentially damage the proposed
147 transmission line. Flyrock is inherent in all mining operations, while it cannot be eliminated, a
148 technique referred to as "matting" can be employed to prevent the flyrock from traveling any
149 significant distance. Tarble Limestone Enterprises does not currently utilize this technique, as
150 the properties in which it mines, when not burdened with an easement such as those sought by
151 ATXI, have sufficient space to accommodate the flyrock. The proposed primary route of the
152 project would require Tarble Limestone Enterprises to utilize the "matting" technique in order to
153 avoid potential damage to the adjacent transmission line. Each 10 by 16 "mat" costs

154 approximately \$1100. As there are not “mats” larger than 10 by 16, typically multiple mats have
155 to be compartmentalized to create a large enough surface to be efficient. In this instance, Tarble
156 Limestone Enterprises’ shots in the areas affected by the proposed primary route are 50 by 110
157 feet. Therefore, at least 35 mats would be required for each shot. In the areas affected by the
158 proposed primary route, Tarble Limestone Enterprises shoots at least every other day, which
159 would thereby require these mats to be moved frequently, adding even more labor costs.

160 **Q. Would ATXI’S Proposed Alternative Route have the same economic impact on**
161 **Tarble Limestone Enterprises?**

162
163 A. No.

164
165 **V. CONCLUSION**

166
167 **Q: Does this conclude your Direct Testimony?**

168
169 A. Yes.